



**SERVICE COMMITTEE - MEL CLEMENS
MONDAY MARCH 27, 2017**

**COMMITTEE MEETING: IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE PREVIOUS
MEETING**

**PLACE: COUNCIL CHAMBERS
7232 E. MAIN ST, REYNOLDSBURG, OH 43068**

1. Call to Order

PRESENT: Clemens, Cicak, Luzader, Spalding, Joseph
ABSENT:

2. Approval of Agenda

Agenda stands as approved.

3. Approval of Minutes

a. Service Committee – Committee Meeting – March 13, 2017

Minutes stand as approved.

4. Discussion

- a. ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE OFFICIAL ZONING MAP OF THE CITY OF REYNOLDSBURG ADOPTED BY ORDINANCE NO. 131-95 ON NOVEMBER 27, 1995 AND AS SUBSEQUENTLY AMENDED – 0 E Main St, Reynoldsburg, Ohio, from CC Community Commerce District to PND Planned Neighborhood Development District, Applicant, Nicole Boyer. (Second Reading 3/13/2017, Planning Commission 3/2/2017; Held from 3/27/2017).**

Mr. Snowden: Thank you Chairman Clemens, other Members of Committee and Members of Council, this Ordinance was reviewed at the March 2nd meeting of the Planning Commission, where it received a recommendation for approval on several conditions. One of the conditions was that we complete the review of a Traffic Study. The applicant, per our procedures, has to provide us with a Traffic Study, which we forward to the City's Engineer, at the Applicant's cost. Our City Engineer is in the process of reviewing. They have reviewed at least four, if not five, of those in the last month and a half. They have not completed the review for this one. Secondly, the rezoning text needs to be reviewed by me. Due to Staff's workload, I have not reviewed the text. I would like to digest that, rather than scramble and have it thrown on your desk right before a meeting and not get a chance to look it over. The Planning Commission's recommendation was for approval. I am going to recommend that the Committee table this to its next regular meeting, in order to allow those two items to be presented to the Committee and the full Council. The Applicant is here

tonight and they are looking to make a presentation. Other than that, I would be happy to answer any questions and I will turn things back over to our Chairman.

Chairman Clemens: Do we have a speaker? Name and address please.

Mr. Swiney: My name is Timothy Swiney with Wallick Communities, 6880 Tussing Rd. Before I get into our presentation, I wanted to acknowledge that Mr. Snowden and I did have an opportunity to speak late last week regarding the zoning text and we both concurred that it was in the best interest to request the vote be tabled in more of an effort to be collaborative and to give everyone an opportunity to review the documents and the text to make sure that everyone has had ample time to review and digest. We did not want anything to be handed to you the day of the meeting and not have sufficient time to review. If it is ok with the Committee, I would like to show some renderings and clarify a couple of points. What I really wanted to do tonight, I know this has been on the front burner for a while and we have discussed this through several meeting, I just wanted to reiterate that the proposed concept is a very innovative and progressive in nature. It consists of a new construction of an entire senior living campus. And, by senior living campus what we mean is a true location where the residents are able to age in place in a quality, decent, safe community, that has all the services and amenities that they need to age in place comfortably. The reason we have incorporated what we have as far as the mixed uses, we have the first phase which consists of a 60 unit independent senior living community that will serve as the catalyst for the entire campus. The second phase is the assisted living component. The third phase is the intergenerational daycare facility. The reason we really looked at this site is 1., the fact that it has been vacant for well over 50 years. We understand that it is commercial. It has been zoned commercial, which I believe the Franklin County portion which is approximately nine acres, has been commercial since like 1955, and the Licking County side since the early 1960's. What we wanted to do is try to incorporate the characteristics of that commercial designation. We did that by incorporating the daycare facility. Why we thought this was unique and very innovative is while each phase of this campus has been done 100's of times all over the country, we have not seen a designation where you have a true campus setting in one location, where residents can literally start in the independent, move towards the assisted living, when needed, and you also have the daycare facility that will serve both seniors and children. The job creation, just from the two housing components alone, we estimate will generate anywhere from 65 - 70 new jobs. All of which will be fulltime jobs. Between these two settings, will also generate approximately \$250,000 of tax base for the City of Reynoldsburg. That is broken up into two components. The first revenue from income taxes which we estimate to be approximately \$40,000 to \$50,000. The second would be from real estate taxes. We understand that the majority of that money goes to the county and to the schools. So, we will be providing a significant amount of annual revenue to the school system without adding any undue stress. And by undue stress I mean, because this is a senior designated, age restricted facility, there are not going to be any children there. And to support some of these claims regarding the ability for the head of the household to be senior, and the rest could be children, we have actually done some research across our entire portfolio in Ohio. Currently, Wallick owns 13 different properties throughout the state. These 13 properties total 664 units. Of those 664 units, we have 20 units that have co-occupants, meaning husband/wife, husband/partner, resident/caretaker. The average age of

those tenants is 67 years of age. Secondly, of the 664 units, there are 8 units that actually have dependents living there. The average age of those dependents is 6-1/2 years old. That represents 1.2% of our entire portfolio of senior age restricted properties. Having said that, the property will be targeting seniors ages 55 years and older. We will also make further age restriction commitments restricting 25% of the units to ages 62 and older. Finally, we will also be targeting individuals that may qualify for the Ohio Department of Medicare Subsidy Demonstration Program. That program is really focused on persons with disabilities that may need assistance through living, having a handicapped accessible unit. Twenty percent of the units will be designed to achieve Section 504, Handicap Accessibility. The last point I really wanted to make, why we chose this project and what the benefits are. As I touched on before, the job and revenue creation. The second main contributing factor is its ability to induce future economic development. What I mean by that is both the local economy will benefit directly, and indirectly, from both construction and the operations. How will that contribute to future economic development. Well first, there are going to be funds spent on material and labor. Secondly, job creation from local suppliers, material providers, service companies. And lastly, the employees that will work at these facilities, because they are going to be working here, will also be spending their money here. Secondly, enhancing connectivity and pedestrian safety. Right now the property is just a vacant piece of ground. There is no connection between the adjacent neighborhood and Main St. There is no dedicated pedestrian walk way. There is nothing. So, as part of our proposal you can see on all three edges, Hanson St., Main St. And Carlyle Dr., we are proposing to install dedicated sidewalks that will connect the surrounding residential neighborhood with Main St., giving them safer access to bus transportation that surrounds all three sides of the site. This project does contribute to Franklin County's Consolidated Plan, which the City of Reynoldsburg did commit to in September 2014. The way it will contribute to that, this project will represent the first housing tax credit project that is dedicated to seniors, age restricted households, in ten years. There are currently 4 age restricted properties, all of which have waiting lists that are 6 - 12 months. Therefore, it is going to fulfill a very unique niche in the community that is currently being under served. I would like to point out some of the collaborative efforts that we have taken within the design itself. In our original proposal, some of the comments that we received back related to how the buildings were oriented along Main St., with the rear building facades facing Main St. We have actually taken that advice and have reoriented the buildings along main Street and Carlyle Drive so now the fronts of the buildings will face Main St., and essentially we are promoting what is called four-sided architecture. So, you won't really be able to tell what the front entrance is and what the back entrance is. Lastly, just the improved landscaping. The proposed site plan provides for an aggregate building coverage of 29.9% less than the 42.6% maximum. So, we are promoting a significant amount of green space. We are incorporating green gardens and bio swells as well as a retention basin that sits in the center of the site. We have natural landscape buffers on both the north and southern sides of the project, as well as the two secondary roads, Carlyle and Hanson St. And again, with increased lighting, site security, landscaping, we feel that the pedestrian access will be significantly enhanced. The point I would really like to touch on is I would like to clarify the type of housing this is providing. There has been reference made to Section 8, whether it is a misunderstanding of the term subsidized housing, or affordable housing. The Housing Tax Credit Program really fulfills a niche, and by niche I mean you have a demographic that can't quite afford market rate house, yet has enough earning or

income that they don't qualify for Section 8 vouchers, so where does that leave them when they go to down size. There is a significant void in the market right now, and just in a 2-1/2 mile radius around our site, there are over 4,000 income eligible senior households that are in desperate need of quality housing that they can not afford. Other than the six units on the independent units that we have committed to renting to extremely low income households, the other 54 have rents that aggregate to 87% of the market. So, we feel that the term subsidized housing has misrepresented the project and we are really filling a neat niche, a market that is currently being under served. With that, I will conclude my comments and I appreciate your time.

Chairman Clemens: Are there any questions at this time? Next speaker is Tom Feusse.

Mr. Feusse: Good evening, I'm Tom Feusse, Chief Executive Officer for Wallick Communities. The same address as Mr. Swiney. I just want to share a little about our company and the kind of work we do, to give you a flavor of who we are and why we would bring this project in front of Council. At Wallick we provide housing, 13 homes, 9 states, around the midwest. We provide homes to 30,000 residents. Our mission is around caring and service. Much of the housing we provide is for seniors. You see a lot of senior housing being built around central Ohio, the State of Ohio, and around our country, but most of the housing being built today are at very high rental price points. For example, if you look at the assisted living market, for which this project has a component, most of the assisted living being built today would have rents anywhere from \$5000 to \$8000 per month. When you take that times 12, you are talking about \$60,000 to \$90,000 a year. Our average resident in this market is 87 years old. There are not a lot of 87 year old individuals that have an income that can afford housing at \$60,000 to \$90,000 a year. So, what is happening for these individuals is, they are in the position where they have to use a combination of their income and their savings. For example, I was with my mother-in-law this weekend, she is a resident in Lansing Michigan. She is fairly frail and is in assisted living but close to going into skilled nursing. Her rent is now up to \$8000 per month and her income is \$2000 per month. So there is a gap every month of \$6000 for her. That \$6000 has to come out of her savings. At the current rate, she will be broke in about two years. This is one example, but there are many examples just like my mother-in-law. So, the situation she is in is she is afraid she will out live her savings and it is a terrible situation for our seniors and it is happening everywhere. It is hard to blame the developers for building these communities. In our particular case, because of the nature of the company we have built, we are trying to take a different approach. The approach we are trying to take is to develop communities that can be of more valued price points to help these seniors to live in more dignity and not be fretting for their savings. So typically in our situations, our rent might average \$3500 in assisted living. My mother-in-law, for example, if we had a community in Lansing, MI, and I could provide her a place to live, and her income is \$2000, now she is only taking \$1500 a month out of her savings account instead of \$6000 she is taking out today. That is what we are trying to do at Wallick Communities. We are a private owned mission based company. We are not public. We do not have to chase earnings per share and we can take a different approach. We have taken this approach in communities like Columbus, Cincinnati, and Toledo. We recently opened a property in Whitehall and there is somewhere hear to share

that story today. We are about ready to break ground in a community in Hilliard that does the same thing, and we are hoping we can do the same thing here in Reynoldsburg.

Chairman Clemens: Thank you. The next speaker is John Lucas. Try to hold these down to four minutes please.

Mr. Lucas: My name is John Lucas. My address is 2 Miranova Place, Suite 700, Columbus. I am here representing the ownership. I serve as a Trustee of a family Trust named the William C. Davis Trust. As such, this property forms a part of this trust. I became trustee in 1996. This property was owned by William C. Davis, and went into his trust at his death back in 1991. The Trust also owns and operates the Green Tree apartments which is right next door to this property. The family had always considered this property to develop multi-family. However, Reynoldsburg never seemed to have an appetite for additional multi family. A couple of times I have gone in and talked to the Development Director and other members of the Administration to see if anything had changed and if there was an appetite for multi family, and the answer was no. I looked at my notes and in September of 2014, Mayor, I met with you and the Development Director and again asked what's the attitude for multi family there and I think "Well John, we think we done the lords work with multi family and so we'd like to do something else there". Well find we'll take anything that makes some sense, please send us if you get any leads on a commercial or non multi-family use, please let us know. But unfortunately, we never had type of inquiry about commercial use. Not any whatsoever. We have had the property available for sale and formally listed the property in May of 2015. We did not get any commercial activity then. We did get the Casto organization with a concept that we talked to the administration about that ultimately, things did not work out for Casto. Then we got the Wallick proposal here that is before you. As ownership, we certainly support this application and we are also a neighbor owning the Greentree Village apartments next door. We certainly would not want something to go in that would be detrimental to Green Tree. I don't know if anybody has any questions of me, but I certainly appreciate the opportunity to speak to you.

Chairman Clemens: Thank you. Next speaker is Zach Woodruff.

Mr. Woodruff: Zach Woodruff, 360 S. Yearling Rd. Members of Council, thank you for allowing me to speak this evening. I am here as a character witness, so to speak for Wallick. I wanted to give you the City's personal experience with Wallick Communities. The City in my experience with Wallick began in 2014 with a proposed 130 unit assisted living facility known as the Ashford on Broad. Wallick's team approached the City, regarding this site which was a declining Ramada inn at the corner of Broad Street and Hamilton Road. The property was in decline and was at risk of losing it's corporate flag. Much like this potential site in Reynoldsburg, our site in Whitehall has a lot of significance not only presently but more importantly for the future. From our first meeting, Wallick's team sought out collaboration with the city, exploring creative ways to ensure that the project met and in most cases exceeded our standards and expectations. In fact, I can assure you and as you've seen tonight, that Wallick will do everything they can to work with community members to ensure that the project is elevated. Due to the nature of our partnership and Whitehall, much like you numerous meetings with stake holders occurred and revisions to the final site were made

that ultimately benefited the development. Wallick's reputation in Central Ohio, and I can tell you in Whitehall is one of professionalism and trustworthiness. You do not have to worry about them cheapening the development down the road or pulling a bait and switch. Not only does a reputation dictate that, your own zoning would not allow them to pull a bait and switch either. They are a long term stable community partner and are contributing members of the community. One of the Wallick employees is President of our Chamber. The last point I would like to make really is about development and it's potential for economic development. Now that construction in Whitehall for the Ashford on Broad is complete, the adaptive transformation finalized, what it did was provide a spark for development in Whitehall. The Ashford on Broad, as I'm sure your Development Director can attest, led to Economic Development momentum, Development is a momentum business. I can draw a direct correlation to the Ashford on Broad and Wallick's assistance in securing 650 new jobs, 30 million in new payroll and over 70 million in new capital invested in our community because we could point back to the development. I am sure that with Wallick's investment and I understand it's somewhere between 15-20 million dollars will ultimately be able to do the same. We were able to showcase additional capital investment in our community through that project. Again, I just wanted to come and speak on Wallick as a partner for the City of Whitehall.

Chairman Clemens: Thank you.

Mr. Kemer: Good evening Council Members. My name is Todd Kemer, I am President of Capital Equities. We are the commercial brokerage firm representing the ownership of the Davis Foundation. Our address is 580 N. Fourth St. We have had the property listed for several years. I have worked in Reynoldsburg leasing spaces since 1985. I cut my teeth back in Blacklick Plaza many years ago. I have owned my own company for 20 years and been in the business for 32 years. We are one of the top ten brokers and commercial leasing in Central Ohio for retail leasing and retail sales. We are one of the top ten commercial brokers in Central Ohio for office leasing and office sales. I am also one of the six super user groups in commercial real estate represented in our commercial side of our Columbus Board of Realtors. We have actively marketed this property for retail and other office/retail uses and haven't really had much progress. Most of our interest has been on the residential side. I wanted you to know that. We think this is a quality development. Also, I think it is important to know the retail centers on Broad, and retail centers on 256 and I70 have also been powerful in attracting retail businesses in those areas. Presently there are over 40 retail vacancies on E. Main St., and they total almost 160,000SF from McNaughten Road to Waggoner Road. With that kind of retail vacancy, and with over 40 existing vacant store fronts, I think there are still plenty of places for retail demand to go. Thank you.

Chairman Clemens: Thank you. Next speaker is Lisa Zambelli.

Ms. Zambelli: Good evening City Council. My name is Alisha Zambelli. My address is 2 Miranova Pl., Suite 700. I am the attorney for the William C. Davis Trust. I previously commented on the project of Wallick Communities and expressed support for the project. I will not waste your time. You have heard Todd Kemer who is much more qualified than I to speak of the commercial demand for the subject real property, and then John Lucas as

Trustee speak similarly of lack of commercial interest. As the owner the Green Tree Apartments at 8000 E. Main St., our team certainly vetted the Wallick Communities project to ensure the project was a quality project that once completed would benefit the value of our asset, Green Tree Apartments.

Chairman Clemens: Did you agree on this for two weeks.

Mr. Swiney: Yes, I agreed with Eric that if we could get the zoning text and the traffic study completed, with enough time for you to review, then I am ok with that.

Chairman Clemens: I want to thank all the speakers this evening. We appreciate having you here. I would like to make a motion that we hold this for two weeks. I have a second from Mr. Luzader, all in favor say, "Aye." (*Multiple "Ayes" heard.*)

RESULT:	ITEM HELD	Next: 4/10/2017 7:33 PM
----------------	------------------	--------------------------------

- b. ORDINANCE TO AMEND THE CODE OF ORDINANCES OF THE CITY OF REYNOLDSBURG, OHIO: AMENDING SECTION 905.03 DUTY TO MAINTAIN SIDEWALK AND TREE LAWN OF CHAPTER 905 STREETS GENERALLY; AND SECTION 917.02 PLANS AND SPECIFICATIONS TO BE ATTACHED TO PERMIT OF CHAPTER 917 DRIVEWAYS. (Second Reading 3/13/2017).

RESULT:	REFERRED TO COUNCIL [UNANIMOUS]	Next: 3/27/2017 8:00 PM
MOVER:	Mel Clemens, Ward IV	
AYES:	Clemens, Cicak, Luzader, Spalding	

- c. Ordinance to Amend the Code of Ordinances of the City of Reynoldsburg, Ohio: Amending Section 913.04 Specifications, Permit Fee of Chapter 913 Private Roadways and Section 1127.09 Underground Electric and Telephone Lines of Chapter 1127 Standards. (Second Reading 3/13/2017).

RESULT:	REFERRED TO COUNCIL [UNANIMOUS]	Next: 3/27/2017 8:00 PM
MOVER:	Mel Clemens, Ward IV	
AYES:	Clemens, Cicak, Luzader, Spalding	

- d. Ordinance Authorizing the Mayor to Enter into a "Governmental Aggregation Program Agreement" with Volunteer Energy Services, Inc., to Provide Full Requirements Retail Natural Gas and Related Administrative Services to an Aggregated Group and Declaring an Emergency. (First Reading 3/13/2017).

RESULT:	REFERRED TO COUNCIL [UNANIMOUS]	Next: 3/27/2017 8:00 PM
MOVER:	Mel Clemens, Ward IV	
AYES:	Clemens, Cicak, Luzader, Spalding	